# Women's Leadership in Global Health With a focus on India, Nigeria, and Kenya

Erin Ingle, Cami Rencken, JF Seide, Akhtar Badshah June 7, 2022



STRATEGIC ANALYSIS, RESEARCH & TRAINING CENTER Department of Global Health | University of Washington

## **AGENDA**

- Introductions
- Project Overview
- Methodology
- Results
  - $\circ$  India
  - $\circ$  Nigeria
  - Kenya
- Recommendations
- Questions



## **PROJECT TEAM**



Erin Ingle MPH Student, Global Health Project Manager



Cami Rencken, ScM PhD Student, Epidemiology Research Assistant



Jean Francois (JF) Seide, MPP MS in Information Systems Research Assistant



Akhtar Badshah, PHD, MS Public Policy, Business Faculty Lead



## **START OVERVIEW**



Leverages leading content expertise from across the University of Washington



Provides high quality research and analytic support to the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation and global and public health decision-makers



Provides structured mentorship and training to University of Washington graduate research assistants



# **PROJECT OVERVIEW**



## **PROJECT REQUEST**

To map the overall labor market dynamics in these key geographies as they relate to women's leadership

To understand what is needed at individual, **organizational**, and societal levels for women to rise *and* thrive in positions of authority

To gather evidence for how outcomes differ when women are in positions of leadership



## **RESEARCH MOTIVATIONS**

## This study aimed to examine:



How outcomes differ when women lead

02

The health sector labor market dynamics

03

The path to high-level employment



How to create gender equitable workplaces





## **WOMEN IN LEADERSHIP THEORY OF CHANGE**

Accelerate progress toward SDG 5 Women have equal access to leadership positions Improved policy and decision-making for issues affecting women and girls

Women's Leadership and Influence toward SDG 5.5\* Advancement of: (1) women's representation in leadership, (2) women's agency & power at all levels, (3) incorporation of feminist leadership\* principles aimed at gender equitable outcomes

#### Individual Empowerment .

More women are empowered to enter and advance in their careers

Women in nontraditional roles have access to role models, mentors, leadership skills, and networking

#### **Organizational Change**

Increased women's leadership, representation, and agency at sector-shaping institutions

Organizations adopt practices that enable more women to rise and thrive at positions of authority and influence

#### Leading organizations serve as models for others, reinforced by public recognition and watchdog-style advocacy

Societal Impact

Growth in proportion, influence,

and power of women leaders

across society

This research is focused specifically on **organizational change** with the assumption that change at this level will have wider effects in individual empowerment and social impact.

#### Learning, Testing, and Adapting

Research track to better underrepresentation and attrition in key fields and identify and disseminate best practices applicable to different types of organizations and for various aspects of discriminatory systems. BILL& MELINDA GATES foundation

## METHODS

## **RESEARCH METHODS**



Perform background research on women's leadership using BMGF provided pre-reads and a grey literature review across various sectors



Gather data specific to the health sector on a country level



Search of relevant social media accounts and threads primarily using Twitter and Facebook





## **BACKGROUND**



"Healthcare, unlike other industries, does not have a women in healthcare problem, but a women in healthcare leadership problem."

- "Women in Healthcare Leadership 2019"

Women make up 70% of the global health workforce but occupy only 25% of leadership roles.

Men hold the majority of leadership roles in health at all levels, from global to community



## **HOW OUTCOMES DIFFER**

# Q

## GENDER TRANSFORMATIVE

CHANGE Women are more likely to hire other women and to support social policies that will expand women's

inclusion in the labor force

• "Glass Cliff Effect"

•



#### GOVERNANCE

- Gender quotas lead to higher average education level of candidates and improved voter satisfaction
- Female leaders on average implemented measures during the Covid-19 pandemic that resulted in less lives lost



#### FINANCE

- Improve financial performance: increase profitable investments, overall fund return & innovation
- Gender parity could add \$13 trillion to global GDP by 2030 and improve 23% GDP growth by 2025 in Nigeria alone





# INDIA



Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture | Technological Solutions

Global Gender Gap ranking: 140/156

**Women labor force participation:** 22%

Legislators, senior officials and managers: 14.6% female

**Health workforce:** 3.1 million (28% of allopathic doctors, 88% of nursing and midwives professionals, 20% of health associates, and 42% of dentists)







#### Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture | Technological Solutions

**2010 Women's Reservation Bill:** Allocated one third of the lower and upper house to women

• Women's representation in politics is 15%

**2013 Companies Act:** Required all publicly listed companies to have at least one woman director on their board

 300 mid-level managers and professional women: 9% of executive boards and 12% of C-suites (Chief Executives)



Source: IBM Institute for Business Value





Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture | Technological Solutions

**Trends:** Women drop out of the workforce after marriage

- Women depend on their husbands and families to make career related decisions
- Women become dependent on husbands because they are not financially empowered to make decisions

Focus: Cultural norms more than women's career

*"a woman must ensure that she performs well as a bahu (daughter-in-law), even if she does not perform well professionally."* 



Only 20% of females in India are doing job. Rest, even if educated, are made to serve family and kids. Women are often forced to leave jobs after marriage. If men think they are facing burden of earning then they

should share house work and let women also earn.

The female labour participation rate in India had fallen to **20.3% in 2019** from more than 26% in 2005, according to World Bank estimates, compared with 30.5% in neighbouring Bangladesh and 33.7% in Sri Lanka. 03-Aug-2021

https://www.reuters.com > india > in...

India's female labour participation rate falls to 16.1% as pandemic ...



...



Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture | Technological Solutions

**Women-led initiatives:** Sheroes - a women's community platform, offering support, resources, and opportunities to empower women to get back to the workforce

**Commitment:** Putting 100 million women on the growth road map, in the next five years

**Award:** The founder, Sairee Chahal, received Onalytica's "Future of work Top 100 influencers and brands" Award

#### SHEROES

#### Join the largest social network for women Get started with SHEROES Enter your mobile number/email OR OR OR OB OB OB OB OB OB

By continuing, you agree to our Terms and Privacy policy







Education & Training | Employment Opportunities | Mentorship & Networking

#### **Higher education attainment:** 49%

Women hold more advanced degrees than men: 53% (undergraduates), 70% (MPhils), 42% (PhDs)

#### Higher education challenges:

Gendered spaces for women including instituting a curfew

# 100 80.94N 82.37N 69.3N 69.3N 59.28N 62.98N 60N 59.28N 62.98N 65.79S 60N 59.28N 62.98N 65.79S 20N 20N 60N 60N

2015

Overall O Men O Women

2018

O Statista 2022 A

#### India: Literacy rate in 2011, 2015 and 2018, by gender



2011



Education & Training | Employment Opportunities | Mentorship & Networking

**Jobs opportunities:** Newspapers, personal references, hiring agencies, companies career pages, online job boards, and social media

**Popular women job platforms:** JobsForHer, Her Second Innings, GharSe Naukiri, Sheroes

**Gig economy:** Providing a great avenue for women's flexibility in the workforce and more opportunities for higher income jobs



Home Get Hired For employers About Us Resources

#### Empowering Women By Providing Work From Home Jobs And Business.

Qween is India's largest online women's career platform that empowers women by providing full-time, flexible and work from home jobs, training, mentorship and networking opportunities.

# Join Us Join Us Implication Sign Up - or continue with - Facebook







## **GENDER EQUITABLE WORKPLACES**

#### Work-life Balance | Workplace Environment

Gender pay gap: 65.5% of what male colleagues would earn

Labor force challenges: Returning to work after a career break or maternity leave

 A handful of international tech companies, operating in India, implemented a number of programs supporting women in their journey of returning back to work after childbirth

**Sexual harassment:** According to the National Bar Association, sexual harassment remains pervasive in the workplace in India

- Women stay in their jobs or refrain from reporting sexual harassment complaints because of lack of trust in reporting mechanisms and cultural norms
- "most women suffer in silence until it becomes unbearable, and then they just try to get another job." Sonia George





To not make women suffer in silence or lose their jobs because of sexual harassment at the workplace, the evaluation of the implementation of the POSH is alarmingly needed, writes Dnyaneshwari Burghate.





## **GENDER EQUITABLE WORKPLACES**

#### Work-life Balance | Workplace Environment

#### 2017 amendment to the Maternity Act

increases paid maternity leave from 12 weeks to 26 weeks and made it mandatory for institutions of 50 or more employees to provide creche (daycare) facilities

- No paternity leave
- 49% of startups or small businesses reported hiring fewer women
- Only 49% of 255 Indian employers implemented the creche facilities

#### **2013 Prevention of Sexual Harassment** (**POSH**) Act requires every employer of 10+ employees to create an Internal Committee

(IC) to deal with sexual harassment cases





Source: IFC/Bright Horizons data.





 $\Diamond$ 



#### Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture

Global Gender Gap ranking: 139/156

**Women labor force participation:** 44.2%

Legislators, senior officials and managers: WEF reported in 2021 that women make up only 30% of managers and around 14% of top managers in firms

**Health workforce:** 14% of health commissioners and 11% of the National Council of Health are women



Source: World Economic Forum





### Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture

- Gender and Equal Opportunities Bill (GEOB)
  - Aimed to give girls and women equal rights as their male counterparts, prevent discrimination against women, and discourage violence against women
  - Recently rejected in the Nigerian senate for the second time
- Other recently failed bills include:
  - Abolition of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women 2006
  - Sexual Offenses Act 2013

"I see gaps in female representation in leadership of health sector projects," she said, adding, "There is no scarcity of women in the health workforce. In fact, the foot soldiers in healthcare are mostly women. However, due to inequitable gender constructs on roles and capabilities, when it comes to being entrusted with leadership roles, that's where the enormous gap is."

Dr. Adaeze Oreh

Federal Ministry of Health





#### Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture

"You see socially we are socialized to accept men as the leaders. Recently, our family was given a slot but I was denied the position because I am a woman and it was given to my younger brother who is my junior in the civil service and less experienced than me. You see the society has placed us as subordinates to men."

- Female Nigerian Health Worker





Education & Training | Employment Opportunities | Mentorship & Networking

- Gender Gap in Equal Opportunities: 146/156
- Early education challenges:
  - Social and cultural norms such as early marriage
  - Religious beliefs
- Higher education challenges:
  - Lack of inclusive work and study environments
  - Dissuasion from enrolling in higher education to undertake family responsibilities

## Program Spotlight

#### Loss of a child, future midwife



One of the beneficiaries of W4H had herself suffered the consequences of this situation. Hauwa, from Katsina state, lost her first child. She started bleeding during pregnancy and she knew she needed to be checked by a trained health worker. Her husband refused to allow her to see the community's only health worker, as he was a man. Hauwa was eventually taken to the hospital but lost her baby. Hauwa's husband later divorced her because she had been cared for there by a male nurse.

Hauwa, Photo credit: DAI.

Hauwa's experiences made her want to become a midwife and help other women like her to receive appropriate,

timely care in their own community. But as a rural woman she faced many barriers that W4H was specifically designed to address - including changing social norms so that women could leave their communities to study and be accepted on return to serve as trained health workers.

Hauwa was supported by W4H's key intervention – the **Foundation Year Programme (FYP)**– a yearlong study and support initiative that helped her to meet the entrance requirements at one of Katsina's health training colleges. Today she is a qualified midwife.



Education & Training | Employment Opportunities | Mentorship & Networking



Education & Training | Employment Opportunities | Mentorship & Networking

"Male domination of top leadership positions in the health sector is attributed to the difference in the level of access of both genders to equal opportunities of mentorship, career development, networking and role models, amidst work environment and organizational cultures that tended to favor men and seem to place women at disadvantage."

- Female Health Worker to USAID

#### Program Spotlights





#### Work-life Balance | Workplace Environment

**Gender pay gap:** the average salary for a woman in Nigeria is 58.4% of a man's salary

#### Challenges:

- Lack of accountability
- Discrimination in the hiring process
- Limited protections and work benefits during maternity leave



Ozzy Udeagwu @OzzyUdeagwu · Jan 25, 2020 Replying to @WorldBank

In Nigeria, yes. There's no legal gender discrimination in recruitment processes. Every gender discrimination in recruitment here is an underground thing.

#### Addressing these challenges:

- Legal organizations
- Social media campaigns

## **Organization Spotlight**





#### Mission

FIDA Nigeria's mission is to promote, protect and preserve the rights, interests and well-being of women and children through the use of legal framework to ensure that they live free from all forms of discrimination, violence and abuse in the society.



## **GENDER EQUITABLE WORKPLACES**

#### Work-life Balance | Workplace Environment

- At the national policy level, there are no clear policies against sexual harassment. They rely on work ethics and the Violence Against Persons Prohibition Act
- Female USAID Health Worker:

"There is no policy on sexual harassment and reporting mechanisms are not strong and when sexual harassment occurs between colleagues, the case is not usually reported because they will see it to be as if they are exposing themselves; they have to sit down and resolve it internally."



Sources: <sup>1</sup>Equileap 2021. <sup>2</sup>Equileap Gender Equality Global Report and Ranking, 20 Note: results are based on publicly available information only.





## **GENDER EQUITABLE WORKPLACES**

Social Media Campaigns in Nigeria to Address Discrimination

....

....

01

## #everydayfeminism



cannonball @a\_nickabugu

Beginning tomorrow, everyday, I will tweet one law that discriminates against women, especially in African countries. I want to see when I run out of material. #everydayfeminism

1:40 PM · May 23, 2020 · Twitter Web App



cannonball @a\_nickabugu

4. The Labour Act of Nigeria prohibits women employed in industries from working night shifts. #everydayfeminism #beingfemaleinnigeria



02

Joyce | Travel + Food 77 4

**#beingfemaleinNigeria** constantly being bombarded or sexually harassed in a male dominated work place.

11:43 AM · Jun 30, 2015 · Twitter Web Client



M. @mxndxyluv

#BeingFemaleInNigeria where a patient sees you in a ward coat as your male counterpart and still calls you nurse

1:33 PM · Jun 30, 2015 · Twitter for Android









Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture | Technological Solutions

**Global Gender Gap ranking:** 95/156

**Women labor force participation:** 72.5%

**Legislators, senior officials and managers:** 24.8% female

**Health workforce:** Made up of the majority of women (70% of nurses, 78% of midwifery personnel, and 43% of medical doctors)



Source: World Economic Forum





Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture | Technological Solutions

#### **State Department for Gender Affairs:**

Solely focuses on enhancing gender equality and women's empowerment

#### Article 27 of Kenya's 2010 Constitution:

"not more than two-thirds of the members of elective public bodies shall be of the same gender."

**2007 Employment Act**: Protect women in the workforce against unfair discriminatory practices







Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture | Technological Solutions

Cultural perception of women as child bearers and nurturers is a disadvantage to women's participation in the workforce

The "Mwenye Syndrome" keeps women in a vicious cycle where they largely engage in unpaid family labor or self-employment in the home and participate less in formal waged employment outside the home.



Let us end Mwenye Syndrome in Kilifi because it's a main Challenge in our Communities. She has the Right to Decide.

#SheDecidesMashinani #NewNormal @Eve\_odhis @kilifi\_youth @YourAuntyJane @SheDecidesKenya






# **LABOR MARKET DYNAMICS**

Sector Overview | Policy & Regulations | Culture | Technological Solutions

**Ajira Digital Program**: Government driven initiative giving young girls and women access to upskilling opportunities to participate in the gig and freelance economy

**Commitment:** Increase women representation in the program to 70% and add 1M digital work opportunities

**Objectives:** Raise the profile of digital work; promote a mentorship and collaborative learning approach to finding digital work; provide Kenyans with access to digital work; promote Kenya as a destination for online workers







Education & Training | Employment Opportunities | Mentorship & Networking

### **Higher education attainment:** 40%

**STEM fields differences:** <9% of females compared >13% of males

**Regulation:** 2013 Basic Education Act promotes more gender neutral practices in the education sector

**Higher education challenges:** Despite earning higher degrees, women's career advancements are often impeded in these sectors due to cultural norms such as meritocracy, gender socialization, and patriarchy Table 1B. Deputy head teachers in Kenya municipal primary schools.

Municipal	Male deputy head teachers	Female deputy head teachers	Total
Nairobi	143	57	200
Thika	41	27	68
Mombasa	62	53	115
Nakuru	44	39	83
Eldoret	39	33	72
Kitale	24	20	44
Kisumu	48	37	85
Total	401	266	667

Source: World Economic Forum





Education & Training | Employment Opportunities | Mentorship & Networking

Jobs opportunities: Personal references, companies career pages, online job boards

**Popular job platforms:** BrighterMonday, Fuzu, Campoe, Jobwebkenya

**Coaching:** Career Point Solutions coaches professionals specifically for jobs in international organizations





# PATH TO HIGH-LEVEL EMPLOYMENT

Education & Training | Employment Opportunities | Mentorship & Networking

Kenya Medical Women's Association: Founded in 1983 by ten women doctors and two dentists.

The association counts more than 400 members.

### Programs:

- Participate in online and in-person skills training workshops
- Access to grants and scholarships
- Local and national networking opportunities for personal and professional growth
- Mentorship opportunities to be connected with experienced physicians
- Supporting young professionals advancing in their career







# **GENDER EQUITABLE WORKPLACES**

### Work-life Balance | Workplace Environment

**Gender pay gap:** Commerce and trade (73% less); manufacturing and construction (77% less); agriculture, fisheries, and mining (42% less); and service (71% less)

Labor force challenges: Returning to work after a career break or maternity leave

Lack of time (6 weeks) and support

**Sexual harassment:** Women are exposed to sexual harassment not only in the workplace, but also going to and from work

- In the workplace, women fear the retribution that comes with them reporting sexual harassment incidents
- On the streets, they are defenseless. The Flone Initiative is is a women-led organization working towards the creation of safe, sustainable and accessible public transportation spaces for women





# **GENDER EQUITABLE WORKPLACES**

### Work-life Balance | Workplace Environment

### **2007 Employment Act** provides women with six weeks of paid maternity leave

- Women leave jobs because of the requirement of coming back to work too early
- No daycare support is provided
- Many workplaces are implementing baby-friendly policies to support mothers



Source: Institute for the Study of International Development



#### FIGURE 2. CHANGE IN EMPLOYMENT BY TYPE OF WORK

# **KEY FINDINGS & RECOMMENDATIONS**

## **KEY LESSONS: POLICY**

It is critical to have **effective legislation** around supporting women in the workforce to create gender transformative change

 $\mathbf{Q}$ 

**Robust regulatory and accountability mechanisms** are essential to foster an enabling environment for women's leadership

**Gender quotas** in leadership are effective at spurring change when used meaningfully



### **KEY LESSONS: CULTURE**

Deeply entrenched **cultural norms** make it difficult for change to take place in the most effective way

Organizational policies that promote **work life balance** are essential in giving women the space to balance their domestic responsibilities





### **KEY LESSONS: TECHNOLOGY**

Technology should be utilized to **catalyze change** at individual, organizational, and societal levels

Technology, through social media, can be used for **activism**, **accountability, and expanding access** to new opportunities

**Implementing capacity building** alongside program implementation may be essential



### **Recommendations**



Lasting societal change happens with an integrated approach, at the intersection of policy, culture and technology CONCLUSION

### **QUESTIONS & COMMENTS**



# THANK YOU

### Questions? Please contact the START Center: <u>start@uw.edu</u>



START CENTER STRATEGIC ANALYSIS, RESEARCH & TRAINING CENTER